



**APPROVED  
SUMMARIZED MINUTES**

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**THURSDAY, APRIL 19, 2018**

**KIVA – CITY HALL  
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD  
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85251**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:01 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT:** Gary Bretz, Chair  
Barry Graham, Vice Chair  
George Ertel  
Pamela Iacovo  
Renee Higgs  
Michael Kuzel  
Don Anderson

**STAFF:** Paul Basha, Transportation Director  
Lisa Johnson, Transportation Planning and Transit Operation Manager  
Rose Arballo  
Jennifer Banks  
Pedro Rodriguez, Transit Operations Coordinator  
Ratna Korepella, Senior Transportation Planner

**3. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chair invited public comments.

Chris Choffai provided comments on a City ordinance regarding oversized vehicles. The existing ordinance is confusing to police officers and the courts. It states that no person shall park or store a commercially registered vehicle with a chassis rated more than one ton, nor any vehicle over 22 feet in length on streets, alleys in a residential area or zone except when loading

and unloading, delivering or making a service call at a residence. The ordinance is ambiguous as to whether it only applies to commercial vehicles. He owns a 35-foot RV, which does not fit in his driveway. When he brings it home to load for a trip, a neighbor routinely calls the police department. The ordinance is vague on how long the RV can be parked at his home. A previous ticket was overturned, and the presiding judge indicated that as long as he was parked 72 hours or less, he was adhering to the ordinance. The neighbor continued to call the police and subsequent mediation did not resolve the problem. Police officers, court officers and other City employees provide conflicting guidance. A “final decision” letter was received from the police department indicating that there was a one-hour parking limit. He seeks to have the City Council address the issue and consider revising the ordinance to be more reflective of adjacent city ordinances, such as Tempe.

#### **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – March 15, 2018
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – March 15, 2018

Chair noted that several minor changes were discussed during the study session.

**VICE-CHAIR GRAHAM MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION MINUTES OF MARCH 15, 2018 AND THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ON MARCH 15, 2018 AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER ERTEL SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

#### **5. BUS AND TROLLEY POTENTIAL ROUTE CHANGES**

Paul Basha, Transportation Director, reviewed existing bus and trolley routes in the City. Five bus routes have 30 minute service, three routes have 20 minute service and one route has 10 minute service, limited to a short stretch of Scottsdale Road between Fashion Square and the Tempe Transit Center. He acknowledged that it is difficult to tell the frequency of the Camelback Road and Thomas Road routes. The 514 Shea Express Route has a frequency of four times per day. Trolley service frequency includes every 10 minutes for the Downtown Route, Camelback at 15 minutes, Neighborhood at 20 minutes and Miller Road at 30 minutes.

He reviewed changes in ridership over the last four calendar years:

- Downtown Trolley: Dramatic increase, changing in frequency from 15 to 10 minutes, resulting in more than 40 percent increase in ridership
- Miller Trolley/Neighborhood Trolley: Ridership has declined dramatically
- Scottsdale buses: Slight increase in ridership with the buses provided by Valley Metro and City of Phoenix
- Metropolitan Phoenix: 10 percent decline in bus ridership
- Phoenix light rail: 10 to 15 percent increase in ridership

Chair acknowledged the reduction in ridership and asked whether this corresponded to the change in boarding practice, i.e., switching from flag stops to bus stops. Mr. Basha said that change was made approximately a year ago. The change was not a contributing factor, as ridership was decreasing during the time of flag stops.

Mr. Basha reviewed a chart depicting cost per passenger boarding for each of the routes from highest to lowest cost. The highest cost is the Priest route at \$24 per rider. The Express 514 has an approximate cost of \$16 per rider. The Miller Trolley cost is approximately \$2 per rider and the Neighborhood and Downtown Trolleys are approximately \$3 per rider.

Chair requested that for future presentations, the cost for paratransit passengers and subsidized passengers be provided also.

Commissioner inquired as to whether there is a nationally accepted value for the cost per rider. Mr. Basha said he did not have an answer to the specific question. While similar costs per rider from other communities can be researched, the acceptable costs are decided by the City of Scottsdale. Mr. Basha suggested that an appropriate perspective is that the goal is not to decrease costs but to increase ridership. If ridership is increased, then by definition the cost per rider is decreased. The Priest route has been operating for three years with low ridership and high expense per rider. As such, this route should be discontinued. Other routes need to be modified.

Chair stated his understanding that when Prop 400 passed, Valley Metro had costs per boarding or per mile standards, which were recommended. Mr. Basha said he would check with Valley Metro to gather this information.

Commissioner stated that the cost of trolley operation is borne solely by the City of Scottsdale and the buses are provided by Valley Metro. Mr. Basha agreed that trolley operation is paid for directly by Scottsdale residents. The Valley Metro and City of Phoenix operation is more nuanced. Scottsdale receives a share of Transit Lifecycle Program funds from the metropolitan region. Scottsdale then gives the funds to the City of Phoenix and Valley Metro to operate the service. Ratna Korepella, Senior Transportation Planner, added that the trolley routes are funded through the City sales tax dollars, whereas for other routes, some costs are offset with Prop 400 funds. The City also contributes through its City sales tax. Commissioner asked whether the City can negotiate the price with Phoenix and Valley Metro. Ms. Ratna stated that every year, there is an intergovernmental agreement with the City of Phoenix and Valley Metro, who provide an estimate of proposed rates for the year and what amounts will be funded through Prop 400 funds. Depending on the negotiated rate, the numbers vary slightly each year.

In response to a Commissioner question regarding the City's ability to negotiate the cost to zero, Mr. Basha acknowledged that it is mostly a one-way negotiation with City of Phoenix and Valley Metro providing the offer to provide bus service at their proposed rate. Scottsdale is free to decline the service. It is also free to make adjustments to fees one way or another by increasing or decreasing frequency. The City of Phoenix passed a sales tax increase approximately two years ago, so their city has much greater funds and hence frequency of operation within the city limits of Phoenix. Scottsdale is free to increase City of Phoenix and Valley Metro service in Scottsdale, if it agrees to increase its contribution.

Commissioner requested that Mr. Basha provide the sales tax contribution to each of the routes. Mr. Basha noted that the cost provided is the total cost from all sources. A more detailed breakdown of costs can be provided at a subsequent meeting.

Chair stated the presentation/discussion is veering off topic as the agenda item addresses proposed route changes, rather than specific cost details.

Mr. Basha reviewed ridership statistics for various routes, noting in particular that Shea Boulevard Express route 514 eastbound daily average ridership is only 20 passengers, in part because it only operates four times per day. The same is true for Shea Boulevard Express route 514 westbound. Chair asked for clarification that the average total number of passengers is the average total daily for all buses and not each individual bus. Mr. Basha confirmed that the average total of 20 is for all buses/routes combined. Chair inquired as to the potential consideration for trying a van pool. Mr. Basha confirmed that there is consideration for that. He also clarified that these vehicles are smaller than the typical 40-foot buses.

Commissioner asked what the X axis refers to in the slides. Mr. Basha said they are not individual stops/locations where riders board, but are points around the route.

Mr. Basha stated that there are several opportunities for improvement with existing trolley routes. Some routes are duplicative. There are four different frequencies for the four different trolley routes, making it difficult to transfer from one route to another. There is currently no trolley service north of McDonald Drive and no connectivity to the recently completed Mustang Transit Center. There is a high cost per boarding on the Camelback Trolley, the highest of the four trolleys. The Neighborhood Trolley and the Miller Road Trolley do not currently serve Scottsdale Fashion Square. The Neighborhood Trolley has excessive turns. Each turn increases the time for the route and therefore increases travel time for the entire route while decreasing the frequency that can be offered.

There are also opportunities for improving bus service. Scottsdale Road Route 72 has 10-minute frequency. It was introduced three years ago. As a result of the increased frequency, costs per boarding increased by 50 percent. Route 56, the Priest Route, has the highest cost, with the second highest cost being Route 514. Mr. Basha reviewed slides illustrating existing and proposed bus and trolley routes.

Chair commented that bus riders typically hate to transfer. While there is an issue with duplication of routes, someone on the Shea or Hayden routes who has come from another city is reluctant to get off a bus and wait in the heat for another bus. Mr. Basha acknowledged that transfers are an obstacle to bus and trolley ridership. The Department endeavors to provide routes that do not require transfers. Some duplication is beneficial.

Mr. Basha continued with the review of new and proposed routes. The proposed Shea Express route comes from Fountain Hills. The Department suggests that it connect to the Mustang Transit Center, continue back north to Shea and then continue west on Shea. The proposal would connect it to the rapid route on State Route 51 at Shea. The rapid route on State Route 51 has 10-minute frequency during the morning and evening 90-minute peak periods. The Department believes the route will provide much better service to people who board the route in Fountain Hills or in Scottsdale along Shea Boulevard. It does still have an express route on a surface street. It is suggested that additional stops occur in the City of Phoenix, but only one stop in Scottsdale at the Mustang Transit Center. Chair asked how many people would be affected by cutting off the southern end of the route. Mr. Basha estimated that it would affect less than two dozen riders.

Mr. Basha stated that in preparation for this meeting, the Department and some representatives from Valley Metro conducted surveys (120 total) on the Neighborhood Trolley route on five different days during morning and evening peak hours. Based on the survey, only 21 percent of the people using the Neighborhood Trolley own cars or have access to private automobiles. Only 23 people who rode the Neighborhood Trolley use transfers to reach their destinations.

Approximately 85 percent are Scottsdale residents. Approximately 10 percent live or board the trolley from Phoenix. Over 30 percent of trips are used for work or home commuting. Slightly less than 30 percent are for school trips. Slightly more than 10 percent use the trolley for shopping. Slightly under 5 percent use the trolley for church. Commissioner commented that the survey results reflect that most riders are residents and not tourists. Discussion ensued regarding the days and times the surveys were conducted and how that might affect the survey responses. Chair urged that schedules be planned to allow students to be on time for school. Mr. Basha noted that the existing Miller Route has 30-minute service and the proposed Miller route has 20-minute service.

Mr. Basha continued to review survey results in terms of age of rider, trip purpose, walking and biking to the trolley locations. Forty-five percent of riders surveyed were between the ages of 31 and 65. Approximately 25 percent were under 18 and approximately 15 percent were 18 to 30. Slightly more than 10 percent were over 65. Seventy percent of riders of the Neighborhood Trolley walked to the trolley. Approximately 80 percent walk less than a quarter mile, 20 percent between a quarter and a half a mile. Only 6 percent of those surveyed used a bicycle to get to the trolley. Approximately 60 percent of those rode their bike less than a quarter mile. Approximately 30 percent of riders rode their bike between one-half and one mile.

Mr. Basha summarized the proposed bus and trolley route changes:

- Eliminate Route 56
- Route 72 from Fashion Square to Tempe Transit Center return to 20-minute service
- Reroute Route 514
- Eliminate service on Shea east of Hayden
- Eliminate Hayden Road Route north of Shea, but still connect to Mustang Transit Center
- Combine the Neighborhood, Miller and Camelback Routes into two routes, 68th Street and Miller
- 20 minute frequency for Miller and 68th Street
- New Cactus route
- Serve Fashion Square, Mustang Transit Center and SkySong with the new trolley routes

Mr. Basha noted that all the changes have the same cost as the existing service (approximately \$5 million). There are no recommended increases in costs to residents.

Chair invited members of the public who wished to speak on this issue:

- Deanna Zuppan introduced herself as an employee of the City of Scottsdale with Human Services, overseeing adaptive services. Seven years ago, they created the first ever community center for the City serving people with disabilities, their families and advocates. She requested consideration for a trolley stop at the Adaptive Services Center located at 8102 East Jackrabbit Road. Transportation is a barrier for individuals with disabilities, as it limits their ability to participate in daily activities. Approximately 98 percent of participants and clients do not hold driver's licenses.

Chair commented that it would be helpful to have an understanding of how many riders a potential route would generate. Commissioner suggested contract with the school buses to provide more customized transportation.

- Kate Bruno stated that she recently began buying monthly bus passes after the Mustang Transit Center was built, as routes 80, 81, and 72 could get her anywhere in the City she needed to go. The proposed route changes would mean that it would be no longer practical for her to ride the bus.
- Don Harris expressed concerns regarding the elimination of the Via Linda and 96 Loop on Route 514. He has lived in Scottsdale since 1973 and currently uses services in the area with his current bus stop at 105th and Via Linda. Contrary to the reported survey results, on a recent Thursday on his way to work, when he boarded at 105th and Via Linda, two people got on at Park and Ride on Via Linda and three more boarded on 96th Street. Drivers tell him that they average 20-25 riders per ride. There are hundreds of homes, condominiums and apartments along Via Linda and 96th and no residents on Shea between 106th and 96th. He posed three questions:
  - What is the rationale for eliminating that part of the route?
  - Is there a savings in dollars?
  - Is there a savings in time?

Valley Metro put out a flier listing all the bus changes in the Valley and stated that the schedule and changes were to provide better service to riders. This change does not provide better service for at least 25 percent of the people who use this route. He requested reconsideration of the decision. Chair clarified that the proposed changes would not go into effect until October at the earliest. Mr. Harris quoted a sign at the bus stop at 105th and Via Linda that indicates the changes will occur on April 23rd. Mr. Basha said that changes are being made in April, but not to Route 514. All proposed changes would be effective in October and not sooner. Some changes to Route 514 are effective this month, but not the ones being discussed this evening. Pedro Rodriguez, Transit Operations Coordinator, said that the Via Linda segment on the 514 Express is taken out; the route will go straight on Shea. There was an average of zero to one in ridership on these stops on Via Linda.

Mr. Harris said that on the days he rides, he is not the only rider. He asked for clarification that the identified segment is being eliminated as of Monday, April 23rd. Mr. Rodriguez confirmed this understanding. Mr. Harris asked about the possibility of reversing the decision. Chair said this could potentially be discussed at a future meeting. Mr. Basha stated that unfortunately, the change is scheduled to occur and everyone is powerless to reverse the decision. Mr. Harris commented that the change produces no net savings, but only reapportions it. Chair clarified that the change will reduce the mileage on Route 514, which will provide a savings to the City. Mr. Basha stated that two different topics are being discussed. When staff states there is no increase or decrease in costs, they are speaking of the changes taking place in October. Mr. Harris is speaking of the changes effective next week. There is a cost savings of approximately \$2,000 annually for elimination of this segment. Mr. Rodriguez said the change was also made, as this is an express route and the modification will provide a direct route to Mustang Transit Center.

- David Tremble introduced himself as a resident and employee of Fountain Hills. He was speaking on behalf of Town Manager, Grady Miller, who provided a letter of support for the proposed changes to bus service. Route 514 is Fountain Hills' only public mode of transportation. The City is currently experiencing financial difficulty. They urge the Commission to consider keeping Route 514 in some form with a connection to Fountain

Hills. The proposed changes would improve service to Fountain Hills. The Town is currently constructing its only bus stop, a park and ride, which will be located where Route 514 stops. They would like to change one of the stops to coincide with the park and ride to be located at the Downtown City center. Chair suggested that Mr. Tremble investigate the potential for utilizing Vanpool, operated by Valley Metro, as a way for commuters to reach Downtown Phoenix. In regards to funding, there is the possibility of 5310 money next year to assist seniors connecting to Scottsdale.

- Dave Hokstrausen (phonetic) spoke in support of the expanded trolley routes. He suggested making the Neighborhood Trolley one direction counterclockwise or clockwise, to free up trollies. His wife is wheelchair bound and some of the ramps even on the new trolley routes are questionable at best. During hotter months, it is difficult to be outdoors waiting for a trolley with a functioning ramp. In addition, routes should connect resorts as well as provide travel to the zoo. Chair asked whether Mr. Hokstrausen has reported the faulty ramps. Mr. Hokstrausen said he has informed the Department. At times, a van is dispatched, however by the time it arrives, the next trolley has already arrived. Mr. Hokstrausen also commented that the routes will miss students of Saguaro High School. Chair commented that the route will come close, being located at Granite Reef and McDonald.
- Lilly Raderhill (phonetic) shared her concern regarding the Neighborhood Trolley. The route is currently perfect, as she hits every other bus/trolley that she needs to hit, including going to Tempe or up north. It is interesting that the Department finally came up with a route on 68th Street that goes all the way to Camelback. The Neighborhood Trolley consists of two vehicles, which go in the same circle, one south and one north. The Pearl hits most locations, where riders are not required to cross the street and catch the Navy Trolley. There is no need for two trollies in the same route. Moving the Navy Trolley to 68th Street provides the same excellent route hitting all the spots. Chair acknowledged that the Pearl and the Navy take the same route in different directions. This eliminates the need to take a route the entire way around when a rider only needs to go a mile in one direction. Typically, one way routes do not work for most people.
- Liz Mueller provided her address at North 73rd Street. The reason she moved to her present location is because her daughters would have access to transportation, including to Scottsdale Community College. She pays the higher rent, knowing that the transportation opportunities are so helpful.
- Melinda Redding commented that the proposed changes are confusing. She uses the Pearl to go to the senior center and her doctor's office. Changing the route will take her very far out of the way. She is concerned about ending up in a location where she will become lost. Contributing factors are health issues with asthma and heart problems. Any travel delays may mean that she does not receive the meals provided for her on weekdays. Chair noted that she can still get to the senior center, however, she would need to make a transfer. There may not be a bus going to the Museum of the West. Ms. Redding said that the transfers are confusing to her.
- Ellen Sarmiento (phonetic) provided her address, located between Via Linda and Mountain View. She supports the proposed Trolley between the Via Linda Senior Center, Mustang Library and the Pavilions. Many of the senior center visitors are unable to drive.

- Thomas Wilding posed questions and concerns regarding the 514 changes. The changes to 514 eliminate the southern portion of Scottsdale where the majority of residents live. The majority of people are getting on from the Scottsdale Road stop over to the community college. By eliminating that section, they eliminate most of the people riding the bus. There are obvious ridership issues for people that have a 90-minute commute via bus, however, riders getting on in Scottsdale do not have this problem.
- Marge Couch - Chair noted that there was a speaker card for Marge Couch, who left the meeting earlier. His understanding is that she was going to provide comments regarding the fact that she works at a free store at 70th and Osborn. Moving the route off of 70th and Osborn will mean that many homeless and low income riders will not have access to the free store.
- Chair stated there were two other written comment cards. One is from Patricia Atwell, who questions what will happen with Saguaro High School when the routes change. Jacqueline (no last name given) provided comments regarding Supai Elementary and Saint Daniel's Church at Hayden and Roosevelt. Many residents who do not own vehicles and live off of 68th Street use the trolley to take their children to school and church. Patricia Atwell introduced herself as a trolley driver and stated that Jacqueline is a Spanish-speaking resident with concerns regarding how travelers would reach Saint Daniel's for Sunday service and night service as well as getting the children to school. At this time, there is not even a stop by Saint Daniel's. Travelers must cross Hayden or walk from Vista Del Camino.

Commissioner asked Ms. Atwell how wave-down stops would affect on-time schedules and safety. Ms. Atwell said in her experience, wave-down stops do not add time to the route. Drivers were previously told that wave-down stops were at their discretion, if drivers felt the area was safe for pick-ups or drop-offs. When asked by a Commissioner whether wave-down stops contribute to the frequency of accidents, Ms. Atwell noted that trolleys have been rear-ended just sitting at regular stops. She did not recall any accidents at a wave-down stop.

Chair noted that when the Neighborhood Trolley was begun, extensive studies were done. He recalls assisting the City of Scottsdale to obtain New Freedom grant funds, as the trolley route was located along low cost housing, senior housing and senior destinations. The route will allow riders to access locations, however they will have to walk farther and make transfers. He believes it is a mistake to get rid of the Neighborhood Trolley. Looking at the charts, some origins and destinations will no longer be feasible. In addition, he questioned the logic of combining two failed routes for the 68th Street route. Years ago, there was a bus on 68th Street, which was eliminated because there was no ridership. There is almost no ridership on the Camelback route and yet the proposal is to combine a past failed route with a current failing route. This is a mistake.

Chair stated that while high school students can ride the McDowell bus a mile farther and catch the bus at Granite Reef, this will require them to ride farther on the Miller Road bus, an alternative which will be much more difficult than what is currently available. He suspects that Villa Monterey will be unhappy to see a bus routed along that segment of Chaparral Road, given the existing traffic issues. He suggested with the current routing, which has the bus go north on Miller to Jackrabbit, Jackrabbit to 78th Street, 78th Street to McDonald and then McDonald to Pima. He is concerned about rerouting the Hayden 81 bus, as a number of people get on



and off at the Pavilions. In addition, what is being added is a lot of traffic through McCormick Ranch, where no houses exist. Perhaps it should end at Chaparral, rather than continuing north. He commented that the City of Scottsdale needs to come up with bus standards. Valley Metro has established standards when passing Prop 400 in terms of productivity and cost. Route 514 is too expensive in light of the very low ridership.

Vice Chair thanked attendees for their participation as well as Mr. Basha's presentation. Any changes in routes will have effects on those who currently depend on them while bringing service to others. He agreed with the Chair that Route 514 should be considered for a van pool as an alternative.

Chair commented that in terms of routing, the 68th Route could be modified to go east at Osborn, connecting with Goldwater through the Downtown District, rather than 68th Street to Camelback. This will support businesses along Goldwater.

Discussion ensued regarding the need for a motion. The consensus was that none was necessary at this time.

Chair inquired as to the other public meetings Valley Metro will be holding. Mr. Basha said staff will provide the information to the Commission, and post it on the City website.

## **6. CAMELBACK VARIABLE SPEED LIMITS**

Mr. Basha reported on the three-year operation of the Camelback variable speed limit signs. The location is Camelback Road between Scottsdale Road and Miller Road, referred to as the Entertainment District. There is a one-way street system around the area. The concern prior to the sign installation was the high speed differential between the eastbound curb lane the adjacent eastbound lane and the adjacent westbound lanes. With the variable speed limit signs, travel speeds have reduced.

Commissioner asked for clarification that the signs are variable (digital) and adjust during certain times. Mr. Basha confirmed this understanding. In the past, the speed limit on Camelback Road was a consistent 35 miles per hour. In December of 2014, the travel speeds were changed. Most of the week, the speed limit is 35 miles per hour. However, from 9 p.m. Friday night until 3 a.m. Saturday morning and from Saturday night from 9 p.m. to Sunday morning at 3 a.m., the speed limit is 25 miles per hour. In addition to the digital speed limit signs, there are driver speed awareness signs.

Commissioner asked about the location of the sensors. Mr. Basha stated that the travel speed measurements location is between the two one-way streets. The eastbound curb lane becomes a very slow moving lane during certain times between 9 p.m. and 3 a.m. on Fridays and Saturdays. The problem existed with the static 35 mile per hour signs. The intent was to bring the travel speeds on the other three lanes closer to the travel speeds in the eastbound curb lane.

Chair asked if there was consideration to drop the speed limit to 15, rather than 25. Mr. Basha said this approach was contemplated. One of the tenets of traffic engineering is that drivers will tend to obey reasonable speed limits, if they understand the reasons. They will not obey unreasonable traffic control and limits. Chair suggested the possibility of placing a variable sign in school zones. Commissioner commented that this is already being done on Via Linda. Mr.

Basha clarified that these are two different discussions. With Camelback Road, the actual speed limit sign changes from one number to another. There are several locations in the City where there are school speed limits, where there is a speed limit sign that is dark when school is not in session. When school is in session, a speed limit appears.

Mr. Basha noted that with the variable speed limit, travel speeds are much more consistent. He reviewed the 85th percentile speeds with variable speed limits as well as locations where the speeds limit changes.

Commissioner noted that with the 25 speed limit at the number one eastbound lane, drivers are conforming to speed limit, however they are just not dropping down as much as the number two lane. He questioned how this could be achieved, while acknowledging that what has been achieved is a positive. Mr. Basha agreed that the signs have reduced travel speeds on the eastbound median lane. It would be better if they could increase travel speeds on the eastbound curb lane, however it is doubtful this will happen.

Mr. Basha stated that the number of collisions had not decreased as much as was hoped, however there is positive data. On weekend nights when the 25 mile per hour speed limit is displayed, the injury collisions reduced by one-third. It is somewhat surprising that the injury collision rate is much higher during the weekdays than on weekend nights. Commissioner commented that this may be explained by the higher volume on weekdays. In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha clarified that most collisions involve no injuries. Another category is possible injuries. This is where the investigating officer believes there was an injury and typically tries to convince the person to seek medical care, which is declined. The injury collision rate equals the number of injury collisions per million entering vehicles. It has been adjusted for traffic volumes. The reason there is a 34 percent reduction is because the numbers are small. Candidly, there has been a higher number of increases in injury collisions during weekdays than the number of injury collisions that have been reduced during the weekend nights.

Mr. Basha reviewed all collision data, which is dominated by collisions that did not involve injuries. Here the news is not as good. During weekend nights, there was a relatively large increase in the number of collisions. The police department is very pleased, however, that the increase in collisions did not include injuries. The police department is very pleased with the variable speed limit, because in their opinion, it decreased the number of injury collisions substantially. They see the large increase in collisions per million entering vehicles being more related to more people being in the Entertainment District in the last three years than the previous three years. They believe that without the variable speed limit sign, the collisions would be injury rather than non injury collisions. Notably, in October 2016, there was a pedestrian collision with the variable speed limit sign in place. Despite being impacted, thrown onto the hood, the roof and the ground, the pedestrian spent only a few hours in the hospital, because the car was traveling at only 25 miles per hour.

Vice Chair commented on Mr. Basha's comments regarding the presence of more pedestrians in the area, noting that with Uber and other ride share programs, it would seem there would be less pedestrians. Mr. Basha acknowledged that he was uncertain how to respond to the observation. Visitors to nightclubs have to walk a certain distance to reach their chosen destination and there has been an increase in activity level at the Entertainment District in recent years. One of the advantages of Uber and Lyft drivers is that they are actively driving in the neighborhood and are well aware of the differences in speed limits. He reviewed the manner of collision statistics both before and with the variable speed limit. Again, the police department

is very pleased with this data. The highest collision type is rear-end collisions. Police officers who investigate collisions have an easier time with investigating this type, compared to an angle collision or a side-swipe same direction collision. Rear-end collisions have the least serious injuries and least damage to the vehicles.

Mr. Basha sought Commissioner Kuzel's opinion on the observations. Commissioner Kuzel agreed that rear-end collisions are much preferred over angle collisions. Angle collision injuries are typically much more serious. He is puzzled by the 6 percent head-on collisions figure. Mr. Basha stated that staff were also surprised that a head-on rate appeared, when there was not one previously. Discussion ensued regarding the definition of angled collisions.

Commissioner inquired as to the traffic volume count between Camelback and Miller. Mr. Basha said he did not have the numbers readily available, but the difference was minimal.

## **7. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS**

Mr. Basha stated that the Paths & Trails Subcommittee heard a presentation on the changes to 68th Street, specifically the portion between Thomas Road and Camelback Road, as well as for a longer length of 68th Street. The Department intends to include the topic at the June Transportation Commission meeting. There will be a public hearing held in May on the 68th Street restriping project. Currently, 68th Street between Thomas and Indian School is two lanes per direction. In many segments, it has a raised median, meaning there are no left-turn lanes. There are also no bicycle lanes in the segment. The restriping project will reduce the number of lanes from four to two and will provide bicycle lanes and left-turn lanes at certain intersecting streets. The pavement there is in poor condition and needs replacement.

Commissioner commented on hearing that the 68th Street Bridge (Indian School north), was in dire condition. In driving by, he noticed that there were delineators to cutback traffic on the bridge. He asked whether the bridge falls under the purview of Transportation Department. Mr. Basha stated that it falls under Public Works. All bridges are regularly inspected by a State agency. When they inspected the bridge underneath the roadway of 68th Street north of Indian School Road, they discovered serious disrepair. The concrete is disintegrating, fortunately only in the inner two lanes. Those two lanes were closed while the outer lanes remain open. The bridge will be repaired during the canal dry-up period in January/February.

Commissioner cited the decrease from four lanes to two lanes and asked whether there is any analysis regarding resulting increased traffic times. Mr. Basha confirmed that an analysis was performed. Traffic volumes on 68th Street between Thomas and Indian School are quite similar to traffic volumes on other sections of 68th Street, where there is only one lane per direction as well as segments of Miller Road, where it is only one lane per direction. The Department is confident that one lane per direction will accommodate traffic volumes.

Mr. Basha reported on a larger project a few years into the future. The City received a considerably large grant to improve 68th Street beyond the segment between Thomas and Indian School. This will include a roundabout at 68th and Thomas and other improvements north and south. This project will not be specifically addressed during the public hearing. Chair said that he has received comments from people that getting out of the Arcadia neighborhood at 68th north of Indian School is sometimes very difficult, as traffic backs up. However, after he explained about the bridge, people were more understanding.

Vice Chair asked what is happening with the Goldwater couplet. Mr. Basha stated that there are currently three major utility projects and three or four minor utility projects under way on Goldwater north of Camelback Road.

Mr. Basha stated that the City is subsidizing travel with ride share companies Uber, Lyft and ExecuCar to and from Scottsdale and Sky Harbor Airports. Lyft has transported 5,700 people at a cost of \$52,000 (\$10 subsidy per ride). Some rides are too short to charge \$10. Lyft was extremely congenial during the contract negotiation initiation. ExecuCar has also embraced the program and were easy to work with during the contract phase. They have only had one rider. Uber elected to not begin the program in March, because of Spring Training season, even though there is an active contract. They felt they had riders even without the subsidy. Each company was essentially given \$100,000 for the three-month study. Uber believes they will be able to spend the \$100,000 very quickly, once they start the program, hopefully in May.

**8. PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no comments.

**9. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Commissioner asked for clarification that there was no need for a motion on approval for the revised bus and trolley schedule. Mr. Basha said that no motion is necessary at this time.

Commissioner requested to place on a future agenda the process by which the Transportation Department gauges success, specifically whether there are quantitative measures or criteria that would apply to different types of projects. Mr. Basha suggested that this topic be discussed at the Commission's May study session meeting.

**10. ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to conduct, Vice Chair adjourned the regular meeting at approximately 9:26 p.m. (Chair had stepped away momentarily).

SUBMITTED BY:

eScribers, LLC

**\*Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**